## Minutes of a meeting of Senate held on the above date at 1:30 p.m. in the Senate Chamber, Room E3-262 Engineering and Information Technology Complex

| Members Present | Mr. A. LeClair Prof. D. Lobb | Dr. S. Coyston, Recording Secretary | Dean R. Urbanowski |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Dr. D. Barnard, | Ms. J. MacKenzie |  | Absent |
| Chair | Prof. D. MacPherson | Assessors Present |  |
| Dr. C. Adams | Prof. S. McClement |  | Ms. J. Dela Cruz |
| Prof. C. Anderson | Prof. K. Main | Mr. J. Adams | Dr. J. Doering |
| Prof. B. Austin-Smith | Dean D. Mandzuk | Ms. S. Bonner-Proulx | Mr. L. Dojack |
| Dean S. Baum | Prof. B. Mark | Dr. D. Collins | Ms. B. Dorais-Fleming |
| Dean J. Beddoes | Mr. D. Martens | Dr. D. Hiebert-Murphy | Prof. B. Elias |
| Prof. M. Bieringer | Prof. C. Miller | Prof. R. Lastra | Mrs. L. Forsythe |
| Dean J. Black-Branch | Dean, T. Mondor | Mr. N. Marnoch | Prof. D. Gardner |
| Dr. J. Blatz | Prof. K. Nixon | Mr. C. Neumann | Mr. H. Guzman |
| Mr. M. Block | Mr. C. F. Nwaiwu | Prof. G. Smith | Mr. M. Haroon |
| Prof. P. Blunden | Ms. L. O'Hara | Dr. D. Stewart | Ms. R.-L. Holter- |
| Prof. T. Bone | Prof. D. Oliver | Dr. M. Torchia | Ferguson |
| Prof. O. Botar | Ms. S. Olson | Ms. B. Usick | Dean A. Iacopino |
| Ms. T. Brenan | Prof. J. Paliwal |  | Prof. T. Ivanco |
| Dean. D. Brown | Prof. S. Passmore | Regrets | Mr. H. Katz |
| Prof. T. Chen | Dean B. Postl |  | Ms. K. Macalinao |
| Prof. S. Clark | Prof. L. Pozzer | Prof. B. Albensi | Prof. T. Peter |
| Mr. M. Colley | Mr. A. Prenovault | Prof. A. Alessi-Severini | Prof. S. Popowich |
| Prof. R. Currie | Mr. P. Raghunatha | Very Rev. R. Bozyk | Ms. C. Reitano |
| Prof. M. Czubryt | Dean L. Raman-Wilms | Mr. C. Bruce | Mr. M. Sharma |
| Prof. D. Delay | Prof. T. Reeve | Prof. F. Burczynski | Mr. M. Shaw |
| Ms. L. Demczuk | Prof. G. Restall | Recteur G. Csepregi | Ms. I. Supel |
| Prof. S. Dhingra | Mr. J. Reynolds | Ms. A. Deol | Ms. V. Truong |
| Ms. S. Dika | Prof. B. Rice | Mr. G. Doak |  |
| Prof. M. Domaratzki | Dr. J. Ristock | Mr. S. Dorge | Also Present |
| Dean N. Dyck | Mr. J. Sanderson | Mr. M. Garrett |  |
| Prof. A. Farenhorst | Dean. M. Scanlon | Dr. G. Glavin | Prof. J. Carlberg |
| Mr. A. Fischer | Prof. A. Schwann | Prof. B. Hallman | Ms. C. Davidson |
| Prof. M. Gabbert | Ms. A. Slagerman | Prof. E. Haque | Ms. S. Foster |
| Prof. J. Gilchrist | Prof. M. Smith | Prof. J. Hare | Ms. P. Gareau |
| Ms. S. Gottheil | Mr. G. Sobie | Prof. M. Hudson | Prof. D. McNeill |
| Dean N. Halden | Ms. J. Steffano | Dean G. Jacoby | Prof. K. Thiessen |
| Prof. C. Hauseman | Ms. L. Stoyko | Dr. D. Jayas | Ms. S. Utsunomiya |
| Dean G. Hepburn | Prof. R. Tate | Ms. C. Kachulak | Ms. M. Watson |
| Prof. J. Honeyford | Dean J. Taylor | Prof. S. Karimi | Ms. M. Yoshida |
| Ms. L. Johnson | Prof. C. Trott | Mr. J. Kearsey |  |
| Dean E. Jurkowski | Prof. X. Wang | Ms. T. Kriegl |  |
| Prof. W. Kinsner | Prof. P. Wener | Prof. S. Prentice |  |
| Prof. R. Koop | Ms. L. Zapshala-Kelln | Prof. M. Rastegar |  |
| Ms. N. Lam | Mr. J. Leclerc, | Mr. D. Samra |  |
| Prof. L. Landrum | University Secretary | Dr. H. Secter |  |

The Chair informed Senate that the Speaker of the Senate Executive Committee was Professor Brenda Austin-Smith, Faculty of Arts.

The Chair welcomed Dr. Martin Scanlon, who was recently appointed as Dean, Faculty of Agricultural and Food Sciences, and Dr. Edward Jurkowski, who was recently appointed as the Dean, Desautels Faculty of Music.

I MATTERS TO BE CONSIDERED IN CLOSED SESSION - none
II MATTERS RECOMMENDED FOR CONCURRENCE WITHOUT DEBATE

1. Report of the Faculty of Graduate Studies Executive Committee Page 4 on Course and Curriculum Changes RE: Departments of Occupational Therapy and Pathology [November 29, 2018]

Professor Austin-Smith MOVED, on behalf of the Senate Executive Committee, THAT Senate approve the Report of the Faculty of Graduate Studies Executive Committee on Course and Curriculum Changes concerning the Departments of Occupational Therapy and Pathology [November 29, 2018].

CARRIED
MATTERS FORWARDED FOR INFORMATION

1. Report of the Senate Committee on Awards

Page 7
[November 15, 2018]
2. Request for Increase to Admission Targets, Bachelor of

Page 13
Health Sciences and Bachelor of Health Studies, Rady
Faculty of Health Sciences (for consultation)
Dr. Barnard reminded Senate that, under the Admission Targets policy, it is the President who approves changes to, or the introduction of, enrolment limits following consultation with the dean or director and with Senate and the Board of Governors, subject to the provisions of the provincial Programs of Study Regulation.

There was no discussion of a request from the Rady Faculty of Health Sciences to increase the annual admission targets for the Bachelor of Health Sciences and the Bachelor of Health Studies programs.
3. Correspondence from President and Vice-Chancellor

Page 16
RE: Suspension of Admissions to Bachelor of Science in Pharmacy (B.Sc.Pharm.)
4. Items Approved by the Board of Governors

Page 17
[November 20, 2018]

## REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT

President Barnard welcomed Senators back from the Winter Holiday. He expressed his hope that, after a busy Fall Term, people had had a chance to be refreshed by interactions with friends and families. He looked forward to members of the University sharing a productive and happy Winter Term.

## V QUESTION PERIOD

Senators are reminded that questions shall normally be submitted in writing to the University Secretary no later than 10:00 a.m. on the Friday preceding the meeting.

No questions were received.

## VI CONSIDERATION OF THE MINUTES

 OF THE MEETING OF DECEMBER 5, 2018Professor Kinsner MOVED, seconded by Professor McClement, THAT the minutes of the Senate meeting held on December 5, 2018 be approved as circulated.

CARRIED
VII BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES
Professor Adams, Rector, St. Paul's College, recalled that there had been some confusion regarding the role of the heads of affiliated colleges on Senate. He noted that section 26 (1) (p) of The University of Manitoba Act specified that the membership of Senate shall include the head of each affiliated college.

## VIII REPORTS OF THE SENATE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE AND THE SENATE PLANNING AND PRIORITIES COMMITTEE

1. Report of the Senate Executive Committee

Page 18
Professor Austin-Smith said the Senate Executive Committee had met on December 12, 2018. The comments of the committee accompany the reports on which they were made.
2. Report of the Senate Planning and Priorities Committee

Professor Main said the Senate Planning and Priorities Committee had not met since the last Senate meeting.

## IX REPORTS OF OTHER COMMITTEES OF SENATE, FACULTY AND SCHOOL COUNCILS

1. Report of the Faculty Council of the Clayton H. Riddell

Page 19
Faculty of Environment, Earth, and Resources RE: Renewal of Articulation Agreement, University of Manitoba, Bachelor of Environmental Science - University College of the North, Natural Resources Management Technology Diploma

Dean Halden said the Clayton H. Riddell Faculty of Environment, Earth, and Resources was requesting that an Articulation Agreement with the University College of the North (UCN) be renewed. The proposal to renew the Agreement had been considered through the Senate review process. Dean Halden said the Faculty strongly believed in the link with UCN that was created through the Agreement. The number of students admitted under the Agreement was small but they had all done particularly well in the degree program. For this reason, the Faculty wanted to keep this pathway from UCN open.
a) Report of the Senate Committee on Admissions

Ms. Gottheil said that, at its meeting on November 23, 2018, the Senate Committee on Admissions (SCADM) had reviewed and endorsed the request to renew the Articulation Agreement, which was initially approved by Senate in June 2012. The committee had noted the success of the Agreement. All four UCN graduates who were admitted under it had subsequently graduated from the University of Manitoba.
b) Report of the Senate Committee on Curriculum and

Page 28 Course Changes

Professor McNeill said the Senate Committee on Curriculum and Course Changes (SCCCC) had considered the request to renew the Articulation Agreement with UCN at its meeting on October 22, 2018. He noted that the revised Agreement included updates to the course mapping. He said the SCCCC had endorsed the request for renewal.

Dean Halden MOVED, THAT Senate approve the renewal of the Articulation Agreement between the University of Manitoba and the University College of the North concerning advanced standing for graduates of the Natural Resources Management Technology Diploma in the Bachelor of Environmental Science degree, for a period of five years, effective September 2019.

CARRIED
2. Proposal for a Post-baccalaureate Diploma in Medical

Page 30 Physiology and Pathophysiology, Max Rady College of Medicine, Rady Faculty of Health Sciences

Dean Postl said the Rady Faculty of Health Sciences was proposing to introduce a Post-baccalaureate Diploma in Medical Physiology and Pathophysiology, in the Max Rady College of Medicine. The program would involve 27 credit hours of courses, including a laboratory course. It had a precedent in a pre-Master's program that was previously offered by the Department of Physiology and Pathophysiology. The Department anticipated that there would be strong demand for the program, from those seeking a route into graduate studies and some professional health sciences programs and from the private sector for graduates.
a) Report of the Senate Committee on Admissions

Ms. Gottheil said SCADM had reviewed admission requirements for the program, as outlined in Appendices 2 b and 2d of the proposal. It had noted that the P.B.Dip. in Medical Physiology and Pathophysiology would be a one-year program and applicants would require a four-year bachelor's degree to be eligible for admission. Ms. Gottheil said SCADM had endorsed the proposal.
b) Report of the Senate Committee on Curriculum and Course Changes

Professor McNeill said the SCCCC reviewed the proposal at its meeting on September $14^{\text {th }}$. Students would be required to complete 27 credit hours, including five didactic courses and one laboratory course. As instruction of the 5000- level courses would be shared with some graduate courses, questions had been raised in different forums regarding whether the Department's graduate course offerings were sufficient to allow graduates of the P.B.Dip. program to proceed to its graduate programs. The committee was satisfied that this would be the case. Professor McNeill said the SCCCC had endorsed the proposal.
c) Report of the Senate Planning and Priorities Committee Page 96

Professor Main said the Senate Planning and Priorities Committee (SPPC) had considered the program proposal at its meetings on August $28^{\text {th }}$ and October $29^{\text {th }}$. The committee had evaluated the cost of delivering the program, as described in observation 5 of the Report, as well as external funding for research projects in the laboratory course (PHGY 5012), as outlined in observation 6. The Faculty indicated that no additional space was required and the Library indicated that it had sufficient holdings to support the program. Professor Main said the SPPC had endorsed the program.
d) Report of the Senate Committee on Instruction and Evaluation

Dr. Torchia said the Senate Committee on Instruction and Evaluation (SCIE) reviewed academic regulations for the P.B.Dip. program at its meeting on September $20^{\text {th }}$. It had focused its review on regulations concerning deferred examinations, maximum time-to-completion, and continuation in, and graduation from, the program.

Dean Postl MOVED, THAT Senate approve and recommend to the Board of Governors, a proposal for a Post-baccalaureate Diploma in Medical Physiology and Pathophysiology, in the Max Rady College of Medicine, Rady Faculty of Health Sciences.

CARRIED
3. Proposal for a Bachelor of Midwifery Degree, College of Nursing, Rady Faculty of Health Sciences

Dean Dyck said the College of Nursing, Rady Faculty of Health Sciences, was proposing to introduce a Bachelor of Midwifery degree. Although midwifery was established as a regulated profession in Manitoba in 2000, there currently was no midwifery education offered in the province. The proposed program would allow Manitoba students to complete a degree in midwifery without having to leave the province. It would also prepare competent graduates to provide quality midwifery services in the province, particularly for Indigenous communities in the north.

Dean Dyck said students would complete 130 credit hours across four years beginning in University 1 (Year 1). Students who were not admitted to the B.Mid. program could use prerequisite courses completed in University 1 toward the requirements of other degree programs. Students admitted to University 1 in the Fall 2019, who were interested in pursuing the B.Mid. degree, would apply in March 2020. Successful applicants would be admitted to Year 2 of the program in September 2020.

Dean Dyck said the curriculum, which was based on Canadian midwifery competencies and practices, had been endorsed by the College of Midwives of Manitoba. It would have a strong focus on: (i) clinical practice, with 80 percent of the contact hours ( 2,654 hours) dedicated to clinical practice and including a requirement for students to manage sixty births independently; (ii) interprofessional education, including nursing and other health sciences courses, and collaborative practice, with interprofessional placements in Year 3; and (iii) Indigenous content, which would be co-developed with Indigenous partners and would be threaded through midwifery courses. Dean Dyck said the midwifery profession in Manitoba had a strong commitment to supporting Indigenous midwifery in the province.

Dean Dyck said the annual intake of six students had been determined in collaboration with the province. The small intake would serve to address attrition in the workforce. Dean Dyck said the province was developing a plan for midwifery services in Manitoba. Based on this, she anticipated that program capacity might be increased over time. Given a commitment to Indigenous communities and in order to support people in the north, up to 50 percent of the six spaces in the program would be reserved for Indigenous applicants, with two of these reserved for applicants from northern Manitoba. Indigenous students would be supported through the Aboriginal Nursing Cohort Initiative (ANCI), which had supported Indigenous nursing students for ten years.

## a) Report of the Senate Committee on Admissions

Page 196
Ms. Gottheil said SCADM had endorsed the proposal to establish a B.Mid. degree at its meeting on November 23, 2018. She noted that up to 50 percent of the six seats that would be available in the program would be allocated to applicants admitted under the Special Consideration Indigenous category. She emphasized that this would not limit the number of seats for Indigenous students who also might be admitted under the general admission category.

Ms. Gottheil said, similar to the Bachelor of Nursing program, applicants would require 30 credit hours of prerequisite courses in order to be eligible for admission. She noted that, because it was anticipated that there would be strong demand for the program, individuals who had previously completed a Bachelor of Midwifery degree or equivalent program would not be eligible for admission.

## b) Report of the Senate Committee on Curriculum and

 Course ChangesPage 197

Professor McNeill said the SCCCC had reviewed the proposal at its meeting on October $30^{\text {th }}$. He said establishment of the program would require the introduction of sixteen courses ( 93 credit hours) across Years $2-4$ of the curriculum. He noted that the course requirements for Year 1 would allow students who were not admitted to the B.Mid. degree to pursue other programs at the University. Professor McNeill said the SCCCC was recommending the proposal.
c) Report of the Senate Planning and Priorities Committee

Page 199
Professor Main referred Senators to observations 6 and 7 in the Report of the SPPC, which describe estimated costs for delivering the B.Mid. program and associated revenues, respectively. The College of Nursing had indicated it had sufficient computer facilities and space to support the program. The Library also indicated it could support the program.

Professor Main said the SPPC was recommending that Senate approve the program and, and on the basis of the its criteria for assigning priority to new programs / initiatives, the committee had recommended that a high priority level be assigned to the proposal.
d) Report of the Senate Committee on Instruction and

Page 201 Evaluation

Dr. Torchia said SCIE had reviewed the proposal at its meeting on November $22^{\text {nd }}$. The committee had noted that academic regulations proposed for the program were consistent with existing regulations for the Bachelor of Nursing degree. Dr. Torchia said SCIE was recommending the proposal.

## Dean Dyck MOVED, THAT Senate approve and recommend to the Board of Governors, a proposal for a Bachelor of Midwifery, in the College of Nursing, Rady Faculty of Health Sciences.

Mr. Prenovault asked whether the number of students admitted to the program each year would be increased, given the expectation that demand for the program would be high or to accommodate greater demand in the future. Dean Dyck replied that the annual intake of six students was based on consultations with the provincial government. She anticipated that capacity would be increased over time, given demand for the program and once the province had developed its plan for midwifery
services in Manitoba, which would give a better indication of the need for midwives.

CARRIED

## 4. Reports of the Senate Committee on Admissions

a) RE: Revised Direct Entry Admission Requirements,

Page 203 I.H. Asper School of Business

Ms. Gottheil said the Asper School of Business was revising its Direct Entry admission requirements, to conform to the recently revised framework for undergraduate admissions at the University (Senate, May 16, 2018). Under the revised requirements, Direct Entry applicants would require a minimum 85 percent average over four required courses, English 40S, Pre-Calculus Mathematics 40S, and any two academic 40S courses, with no grade lower than 70 percent in any of these.

Ms. Gottheil said the faculty had reviewed historical applicant data to ensure the revised requirements were appropriate and would support student success in the B.Comm.(Hons.) program. Currently, Direct Entry applicants were required to have completed Pre-calculus Mathematics 40S or Applied Mathematics 40S. Data showed that most Direct Entry applicants had completed Pre-calculus 40S, but some had presented a higher grade in another mathematics course that was, perhaps, not as rigorous, for admission. The revised admission requirements would be in line with those for similar programs at other Canadian universities.

Ms. Gottheil said SCADM had endorsed the revised admission requirements at its meeting on November 23, 2018.

Ms. Gottheil MOVED, on behalf of the committee, THAT Senate approve the Report of the Senate Committee on Admissions concerning revised Direct Entry admission requirements for the I.H. Asper School of Business, effective for the Fall 2021 intake.

CARRIED
b) RE: Revised Admission Requirements, Special

Page 207 Consideration Admission Category, I.H. Asper School of Business

Ms. Gottheil said the Asper School was proposing to modify the requirements for the Special Consideration Category for admission, to clarify these for applicants and administrators. She noted that, in the Asper School, the Special Consideration Category was intended for applicants who, because of compassionate or medical circumstances, may not have performed to their potential. Typically, no more than four applicants applied to the faculty under this category in any given year.

Ms. Gottheil said SCADM had endorsed the proposal.

Ms. Gottheil MOVED, on behalf of the committee, THAT Senate approve the Report of the Senate Committee on Admissions concerning revised requirements for the Special Consideration admission category, I.H. Asper School of Business, effective for the Fall 2020 intake.

CARRIED
5. Reports of the Senate Committee on Instruction and Evaluation
a) RE: Proposed Policy on Authorized Withdrawal or

Page 216 Program Withdrawal from the M.D. Program, Max Rady College of Medicine

Dr. Torchia said SCIE had endorsed a proposal from the Max Rady College of Medicine, to establish a policy on Authorized Withdrawal or Program Withdrawal from the M.D. Program, at its meeting on November $22^{\text {nd }}$. The policy would formalize processes for both Program Withdrawal and Authorized Withdrawal, including conditions for re-enrolment. Of note, students who had been away from the program for three or more years, on an Authorized Withdrawal, would be required to reapply for admission. This aligned with the College of Physicians and Surgeons of Manitoba's requirement that physicians who had not practiced for three years must reapply for a license.

Dr. Torchia MOVED, on behalf of the committee, THAT Senate approve the Report of the Senate Committee on Instruction and Evaluation concerning a proposed policy on Authorized Withdrawal or Program Withdrawal from the M.D. Program, Max Rady College of Medicine, effective September 1, 2019.

CARRIED
b) RE: Proposed Essential Skills and Abilities (Technical

Page 224
Standards) for Admission, Promotion, and Graduation in the M.Sc. in Genetic Counselling Program, Department of Biochemistry and Medical Genetics

Dr. Torchia said SCIE had endorsed a proposal from the Department of Biochemistry and Medical Genetics, to establish Essential Skills and Abilities (Technical Standards) for Admission, Promotion and Graduation in the M.Sc. in Genetic Counselling Program. The policy grouped essential skills and abilities, which were derived from practice-based competencies defined by the Accreditation Council for Genetic Counseling, into four domains: genetics expertise and analysis; interpersonal, psychosocial and counselling skills; education; professional development and practice. It also specifies that any student who cannot demonstrate the essential skills and abilities throughout their course of studies would be recommended to withdraw from the program.

Dr. Torchia MOVED, on behalf of the committee, THAT Senate approve the Report of the Senate Committee on Instruction and

Evaluation concerning proposed Essential Skills and Abilities (Technical Standards) for Admission, Promotion and Graduation in the M.Sc. in Genetic Counselling Program, Max Rady College of Medicine, effective September 1, 2019.

CARRIED
6. Report of the Faculty Council of Graduate Studies on Course,

Page 242 Curriculum and Regulation Changes RE: Department of Electrical and Computer Engineering

Dean Mondor said the Department of Electrical and Computer Engineering was proposing to reduce the number of credit hours required, for the Master of Science in Electrical and Computer Engineering, from 18 to 12 credit hours. All 12 credit hours would be at the 7000- level or higher. The proposed change arose from a graduate program review completed several years earlier. It would bring the requirements into alignment with those for similar programs across Canada and would allow students to focus more on research.

Dean Mondor MOVED, seconded by Professor Kinsner, THAT Senate approve the Report of the Faculty of Council of Graduate Studies on Course, Curriculum and Regulation Changes concerning the Department of Electrical and Computer Engineering, effective September 1, 2019.

CARRIED

## X ADDITIONAL BUSINESS

1. Notice of Motion

Page 246
The Chair reminded Senators that Professor Gabbert had given Notice of Motion at the previous meeting. He invited Professor Gabbert to make his motion.

Professor Gabbert MOVED, seconded by Professor Botar, THAT the Senate strongly recommend that the Board of Governors modify its procedures for the presidential search to stipulate that the names of short-listed candidates be made known to the University community, that each shortlisted candidate deliver a public presentation to the University community of his or her vision of the University, and that members of the University community be permitted to make submissions to the search committee regarding their assessments of short-listed candidates.

Professor Gabbert observed that the process described in the motion was identical to that used in the selection of deans and heads of departments, although it was not used in the process to select the Provost and Vice-President (Academic). He said the process represented a critically important opportunity for collegial input into the selection of leaders in the University community and he argued that, given that the selection of the president was a matter of utmost important to the University community, the opportunities for collegial input into the selection process should not be fewer than those for input into the selection processes for other important appointments of administration.

Referring to the view held by some, that candidates for the presidency would be reluctant to come forward knowing that, if were they not selected their failure would become a matter of public knowledge, Professor Gabbert suggested that a certain strength of character was required. That same strength of character and a commitment to collegial processes were also essential requirements for the position of president.

Professor Gabbert observed that the motion was consistent with Senate's right to make recommendations to the Board on any matter considered by Senate to be of interest to the University (The University of Manitoba Act, Section 34(1)(s)). Recalling President Barnard's comments at the previous meeting regarding the need for universities to respond to increasing and various threats to institutional autonomy, Professor Gabbert said Senate was an essential institution within the University in terms of reflecting, preserving, and protecting the necessary autonomy of academic life. Senate embodied and affirmed collegial processes and principles essential to academic life, and if these things were not robustly protected and affirmed, then autonomy would become meaningless. Professor Gabbert argued that collegial participation in selecting its leadership was central to the functioning and autonomy of the University, and the motion represented an attempt to affirm that principle. He expressed his hope that Senators would support the motion.

Professor Austin-Smith said she would support the motion and would echo remarks made by Professor Gabbert. She contended that an open process would be of benefit not only to the University community, the Board of Governors, and the Presidential Search Committee, but also to the candidates. To have candidates make a presentation to the University community would require strength of character, composure, and commitment to collegial processes. The open debate, discussion, and exchange of ideas that might follow could also provide the candidates and the Presidential Search Committee with an opportunity to assess institutional fit, by introducing candidates to live issues of their potential workplace and giving members of the University community a sense of the range of strengths that each applicant would bring to the role.

Professor Blatz said he appreciated the spirit of the motion. He observed that an open search would be unusual, based on his review of processes followed recently at other U15 institutions. He cautioned Senators to consider how an open process might affect the candidate pool, which would potentially restrict the candidate pool, as prospective candidates would consider the possible ramifications of being unsuccessful, including how it might affect their prospects when subsequently applying for other positions. Professor Blatz said it was unfair to suggest that individuals who did not want their name made public in a competition for a presidential position were lacking character. It was a pragmatic reality given the limited number of positions at this level. He said it would be important to have the best possible candidate pool, in order to identify the best individual for the position, who would lead the University where it needed to go into the future.

Mr. Prenovault said the motion was essential; given that the University was a publicly funded institution, the University community should have a voice in the discussion of who should be the next president.

Page 11 of 13

Dean Baum said she would support the motion. She suggested, based on her own experience when she applied for the deanship of the Faculty of Science, that it was important for the University and for the candidates that they be invested in the competition for the position. For the candidates, an open search process would provide a greater opportunity to learn about the institution through robust interaction with members of the community, which could inform their decision on whether to accept the position if they were selected. Also, an individual selected through such a process would, in principle, assume the role knowing that they had the support of members of the University community that they would lead.

Dean Baum and Professor Miller said that, at public institutions in the United States, an open process was used in president and provost searches, with shortlisted candidates made known to the campus and typically involving presentations and other public interactions. They suggested that, at these places, an open process had not adversely affected the candidate pool. Professor Miller remarked, based on her past participation on search committees for such positions, that it is generally known when candidates have not been successful in previous competitions elsewhere, even where the search may have been closed.

Observing that objections to the motion related to practical considerations of potential candidates, Professor Botar asked President Barnard whether an open search process would have affected his decision to apply for his current position. President Barnard said he had been in an anomalous position, as he had been out of the academy for several years when approached to consider the opportunity at the University of Manitoba. His decision did not compromise anything in the enterprise he was then leading. In those circumstances, whether the selection process was open probably would have been immaterial.
Acknowledging that processes at institutions in the United States were different, President Barnard observed that three individuals recently appointed as presidents at Canadian universities, including the president of Brandon University, had been sitting presidents at other institutions. Speaking hypothetically and from a personal perspective, he said that if he was to apply to be president at another institution and to be unsuccessful in an open search, he would feel compromised in his position at the University.

Professor Oliver acknowledged the principles of the motion and the comments in support of it. He suggested that the timing of the motion was, perhaps, too late, as the process had been decided in September. He remarked that, at the previous meeting, Senate had elected five of its members to serve on the Presidential Search Committee and to work with the established procedures shared with Senate at that time. He suggested that, for Senators to now suggest that the process was not appropriate was, perhaps, an expression of a lack of confidence in those people who were elected to engage in the process as Senate's representatives. Professor Gabbert disagreed, saying that he had complete confidence in those individuals who had been elected.

Professor MacPherson said it was, perhaps, incongruous to suggest that candidates for dean and director positions, who might be seeking to move between institutions, somehow had less to lose in an open search process. Often, searches for these positions also sought to identify external candidates of experience and high calibre. Professor MacPherson suggested that an open
process that required that candidates be prepared to speak to the University community, rather than only the search committee, was important with respect to collegiality but also because requiring that they to make a presentation to the campus community was important, because they might otherwise tailor their presentations to address what the search committee considered appropriate.

The motion was CARRIED.
Mr. Leclerc said Senate's recommendation would be conveyed to the Board of Governors.

## XI ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 2:23 p.m.
These minutes, pages 1 to 13 , together with the agenda, pages 1 to 246 , comprise the minutes of the meeting of Senate held on January 9, 2019.

